TECHNICAL EVALUATION REPORT

(As per Rule 35 of PP Rules 2004)

1	Name of Procuring Agency:	**Karachi Port Trust**
2	Method of Procurement:	**Notice for tender invitation through news paper published in Daily Nai Baat and The News on 12.03.2025 and tender documents uploaded in KPT & PPRA websites on 30.03.2025 under PPRA rule 36(b) i.e. single stage two envelope procedure.**
3	Title of Procurement:	**Refurbishment / major refit including renewal of electro mechanical crane's component and steel structure, sheaves, gears, shafts trueness with alignment open gears checking and repair and safe transportation for refitting / installation and commissioning etc of FC-HATHI.**
4	Tender Inquiry No:	**T3/12/24**
5	PPRA Ref. No (TSE):	**TS 558631E**
6	Date & Time of Bid Closing:	**15-04-2025 at 11:00 hrs**
7	Date & Time of Bid Opening:	**15-04-2025 at 11:30 hrs**
8	No of Bids Received:	**01 No.**
9	Criteria for Bid Evaluation:	**As per TEC**
10	Details of Bid(s) Evaluation:	**Given Below**

Name of Bidder	**Technical Marks**	**Rule/ Regulation/SBD/policy /Basis for Rejection/ Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules,2004**
M/s Al Meena Marine Engineers	**99 Marks Weightage=69.3 out of 70**	**Qualified**

Most Advantageous Bidder **M/s Al Meena Marine Engineers**

11. Any other additional / supporting information, the procuring agency may like to share.
(Attached)

Signature:.....

TEC Convener

CHIEF MECH. & ELECT. ENGINEER-I,
MECH. & ELECT. DEPARTMENT
KARACHI PORT TRUST

Official Stamp:.....

No. (M)/CMEE-I/MWS/FC HATHI/2025/058

Dated: 10-06-2025

OFFICE OF THE
CHIEF M&EE & ELEC ENGINEER-I
MANORA WORKSHOP
KARACHI

DY.CHIEF ELECT ENGIEER (S&C)

REFURBISHMENT / MAJOR REFIT INCLUDING RENEWAL OF ELECTRO MECHANICAL CRANE'S COMPONENT AND STEEL STRUCTURE, SHEAVES, GEARS, SHAFTS TRUENESS WITH ALIGNMENT OPEN GEARS CHECKING AND REPAIR AND SAFE TRANSPORTATION FOR REFITTING / INSTALLATION AND COMMISSIONING ETC OF FC-HATHI.

References:

A. Tender (Technical Bid) of M/s. Al Meena Marine Engineers opened on 15-04-2025.
B. Technical Evaluation Committee constituted by GM(E) on 18/04/2025 (PP-17).
C. DCEE(S&C) letter No.(M)/T3/Refb/Maj Refit/FC-Hathi/2024/**162** dt. 18/04/2025.
D. CM&EE-I letter No.(M)/CM&EE-I/2025/042 dt. 09/04/2025.
E. CM&EE-II letter No. (M)/T3/Refb/Maj Refit/FC-Hathi/2024/181 dt. 02/05/2025.
F. M/s. Al Meena Marine Engineers letter No. Al-42140525 dt. 06/05/2025.
G. CM&EE-II letter No. (M)/T3/Refb/Maj Refit/FC-Hathi/2024/198 dt. 09/05/2025.
H. **Technical Evaluation Committee Report** dt. **19/05/2025**.

In pursuance to above references, it is intimated that after thoroughly evaluation of the Technical Bid of **M/s Al Meena Marine Engineers** & further clarification submitted by the said firm, the **Technical Evaluation Committee** (TEC) has finalized its evaluation and unanimously declared the Technical Bid/Proposal of tendered participating firm i.e. **M/s Al Meena Marine Engineers** as **"Technically Qualified / acceptable"** and also recommended that their **Financial Bid** may be opened after obtaining necessary approval of the Competent Authority.

In this regard the following documents (duly signed by TEC) are hereby forwarded for further necessary action / processing at your end:

a. Technical Evaluation Committee Report dated 19-05-2025 (03 Pages).
b. Technical Evaluation Criteria (04 Pages).
c. Proforma 'A' & 'B' (02 Pages).
d. Comparative Statement (08 Pages).

10/6

CHIEF MECH & ELECT ENGINEER – I
(Convener)

Enclosed: **(as mentioned above)**
Copy to:

- GM(E)

KARACHI PORT TRUST
MECH & ELECT ENGG DEPTT – I

TECHNICAL EVALUATION REPORT

Dated: 19 -05-2025

REFURBISHMENT / MAJOR REFIT INCLUDING RENEWAL OF ELECTRO MECHANICAL CRANE'S COMPONENT AND STEEL STRUCTURE, SHEAVES, GEARS, SHAFTS TRUENESS WITH ALIGNMENT OPEN GEARS CHECKING AND REPAIR AND SAFE TRANSPORTATION FOR REFITTING / INSTALLATION AND COMMISSIONING ETC OF FC-HATHI.

References:

A. Tender (Technical Bid) opened on 15-04-2025.
B. GM(E) approval for constitution of Technical Committee vide Min -27 dated 18 Apr 2025.
C. DCEE(S&C) letter No.(M)/T3/Refb/Maj Refit/FC-Hathi/2024/162 dated 18-04-2025.

1. Tender for the subject work was invited through press advertisement under PPRA rule 36 (b), (**i.e.** single stage two envelope procedure) and the same were published in the newspaper on 12-03-2025. Tender Notice was also uploaded in KPT and PPRA Website. In response, on the day of Tender Opening i.e. **15-04-2025**, only a single bidder i.e. **M/s Al Meena Marine Engineers** participated and submitted their technical and financial bid /offer. Technical Bid was opened and Sealed Financial Bid was kept in safe custody.

2. For evaluation of Technical Bid of the participating firm, vide Min -27 dated **18-04-2025,** the GM(E) constituted the Technical Committee comprising of following officers to evaluate the Technical proposal of above single participating firm:

a.	**Mr. Hassan Askari**	**CM&EE – I**	**-**	**(Convener)**
b.	**Mr. Hanif Shah**	**DY: CME(W/S)**	**-**	**(Member)**
c.	**Mr. Amanullah**	**DY: CME(F/C-I & II)**	**-**	**(Member)**
d.	**Mr. Haris Usman**	**Asst. Manager Finance**	**-**	**(Member)**
e.	**Mr. Imran Ahmed**	**ME(Tugs)**	**-**	**(Member)**

3. Tender File comprising of Technical Bid of M/s. Al Meena Marine Engineers was forwarded to Convener of TEC vide letter No. (M)/T3/Refb/Maj Refit/FC-Hathi/2024/162 dated 18-04-2025 for scrutiny. In this regards, the meeting of technical Evaluation Committee was held on **22-04-2025**, followed by 25-04-2025 in the office of CM&EE –I (Convener). The meeting was chaired by CM&EE –I and all the above mentioned members of TEC attended the meeting.

4. Technical proposal of tendered participating firm i.e. **M/s. Al Meena Marine Engineers** was thoroughly scrutinized by Technical Evaluation Committee viz. a viz. tendered Scope of Work, B.O.Q., Technical Evaluation Criteria as well as terms and conditions.

5. After detailed deliberation, TEC observed that in addition to KPT's terms & conditions as mentioned in KPT Scope of Work as well as in the B.O.Q, **M/s Al Meena Marine Engineer** have mentioned more/own terms and condition which are reproduced below

a. All Work will be carried out in KPT premises
b. Due to the unavailability of the site or any other reasons, such as whether conditions, the delay work will not be counted against us.
c. The above quoted amount as per BOQ of Tender Scope of Work any extra work will be changed extra accordingly.
d. Electricity, Fire coverage will be provided free of cost by KPT.
e. Hot work will be allowed day & night by KPT.
f. Force majeure: Al Meena Marine Engineers shall not be liable for delay or default in fulfilling any obligation arising her under that is cause by strike, riots, civil commotions, war, embargo, Government interference, Act of God or other Act or Natural phenomena beyond its reasonable control.

Contd.....P/02

19/5/25

6. Accordingly, above details were communicated by Convener of TEC to vide letter No. vide letter No. (M)/CM&EE-I/2025/042 dated 29-04-2025 and informed that out of above, the terms and conditions mentioned at S.No. "e" & "f" are considerable to KPT whereas the remaining Terms and Conditions at S.No. **"a", "b", "c" & "d"** of Para-5 above are required to be clarified from **M/s. Al Meena Marine Engineers**. Therefore, it was requested to ask the firm to clarify & re-assess the same at the earliest. Further, it was also requested to ask the firm to confirm that their firm will undertake the subject work as per quantity given in the KPT's tendered Scope of Work / B.O.Q.

7. Accordingly, requested was made to M/s. Al Meena Marine Engineers vide CM&EE-II letter dated 02-05-2025 that revised terms & condition (duly clarified & re-assessed) and confirmation as requested above may please be furnished **within 07 days** of receipt of this letter.

8. In response, **M/s Al Meena Marine Engineers** submitted their clarification / confirmation vide letter No. Al-42140525 dated 06 May 2025 and same was furnished to convener of TEC, vide letter No. **(M)/T3/Refb/Maj Refit/FC-Hathi/2024/198** dated 09-05-2025. TEC noted that **M/s Al Meena Marine Engineers** have furnished their clarification/ confirmation which are reproduced as under:

a. Mechanical work will be executive at out firm's workshop, while the Fabrication and installation tasks will be conducted on-site at KPT premises, as per the agreed scope.

b. Force majeure clauses, as stipulated in the contract, will apply to delays arising from unforeseen circumstances, including adverse weather or site unavailability. Such delays will not be attributed to our firm.

c. The quoted amount strictly adheres to the BOQ provided by KPT under the tender scope.

d. The cost for Electricity and Fire coverage has already been factored into our submitted quotation.

We remain committed to delivering the project in compliance with KPT's specifications and timelines.

9. Later on, the 2nd Meeting of the Technical Evaluation Committee held on **19-05-2025** in the Office of CM&EE-I (Convener) and all the Committee members attended the meeting. Technical Evaluation Committee discussed the response regarding Terms & Conditions received from **M/s Al Meena Marine Engineers** and also reviewed their Technical proposal. After threadbare discussion, the Technical Evaluation Committee agreed with the Terms & Conditions / confirmation furnished by **M/s Al Meena Marine Engineers.** TEC also noted that firm have complied all the Mandatory & Technical requirement of Technical Evaluation Criteria, well experienced, financially sound and have obtained **99 Marks** out of **100 Marks**. Therefore, TEC unanimously declares the Technical Bid/Proposal of tendered participating firm i.e. **M/s Al Meena Marine Engineers** as **"Technically Qualified / acceptable"** and recommends that their Financial Bid may be opened after obtaining necessary approval of the Competent Authority. The TEC finalized the following terms & conditions:

TERMS AND CONDITIONS:

i. **Validity Period**: **90 Days** w.e.f. 15-04-2025 ie. the date of tender opening.

ii. **Delivery / Completion Period**: **120 Days** from the date of award of confirmed Work Order by KPT to the firm.

iii. **Guarantee**: **12 Month Guarantee /Warranty** w.e.f. date of delivery, completion and satisfactory test / trials of subject work.

iv. **Terms of Payment**:

a. **40% payment** upon shifting of machinery / Items / Components etc.etc *(as mentioned in Scope of Work)* from F.C Hathi to firm's Workshop and after complete repair / maintenance /overhauling etc. etc. of the same duly verified by KPT's nominated Project Engineer(s) at firm's premises / onboard FC Hathi (where applicable).

Contd.....P/03

19/5

19/5/25

b. **60% remaining payment** after completion of entire work & satisfactory test & trials of complete project as per KPT's tendered Scope of Work.

v. Tools, lifting equipment, welding machine, welding electrode, gas cutting equipment and gas cylinder is firm's responsibility during the repair work.

vi. Transportations from Craft to work place, to Craft are firm's responsibility.

vii. Safety and safety equipments are firm's responsibility during repair.

viii. Any unforeseen work during repair is firm responsibility.

ix. Upon completion of repair work the satisfactory test trial in the presence of ship Engineer / staff is firm responsibility.

Other Terms & Conditions:

a. Mechanical work will be executive a firm's workshop, while the Fabrication and installation tasks will be conducted on-site at KPT premises, as per the agreed scope.

b. Force majeure clauses, as stipulated in the contract, will apply to delays arising from unforeseen circumstances, including adverse weather or site unavailability. Such delays will not be attributed to the firm.

c. The quoted amount strictly adheres to the BOQ provided by KPT under the tender scope.

d. Electricity, Fire coverage will be provided by KPT The cost for Electricity and Fire coverage has already been factored by the firm in their submitted quotation.

e. Hot work will be allowed day & night to the firm by KPT.

f. Force majeure: Al Meena Marine Engineers shall not be liable for delay or default in fulfilling any obligation arising her under that is cause by strike, riots, civil commotions, war, embargo, Government interference, Act of God or other Act or Natural phenomena beyond its reasonable control.

g. Firm shall remain committed to delivering the project in compliance with KPT's specifications and timelines.

10. The comparison of Technical Evaluation Criteria, Proforma "A" & "B" and Comparative Statement details are duly signed and enclosed with this Technical Evaluation Report.

Imran Ahmed
Mech Engineer (Tugs)
(Member)

Haris Usman 19/5/25
Asst. Manager Finance
(Member)

Hanif Shah
DY: CME(W/S)
(Member)

Amanullah
DY: CME(F/C-I & II)
(Member)

19/5

Hassan Askari
CHIEF MECH & ELECT ENGINEER – I
(Convener)

KARACHI PORT TRUST
MECH & ELECT DEPARTMENT – I

TECHNICAL EVALUATION CRITERIA

REFURBISHMENT / MAJOR REFIT INCLUDING RENEWAL OF ELECTRO MECHANICAL CRANE'S COMPONENT AND STEEL STRUCTURE, SHEAVES, GEARS, SHAFTS TRUENESS WITH ALIGNMENT OPEN GEARS CHECKING AND REPAIR AND SAFE TRANSPORTATION FOR REFITTING / INSTALLATION AND COMMISSIONING ETC OF FC-HATHI.

i. Mandatory Requirement

The firm should fulfill the following mandatory requirement / conditions and supporting documents should be submitted accordingly: (Non compliance of any ***Mandatory Conditions*** will lead to rejection of bid).

S. No.	Description	M/s Al Meena Marine Engineers.	Page No:
1.	In case of companies and firms, last 03 years audited financial statements are to be provided showing minimum average turnover of **Rs 150 million.** **OR** In case of individuals / Sole proprietors, last 03 years tax returns filed with FBR are to be provided showing minimum turnover of **Rs 150 million** minimum on average for 03 years.	**Complied**	**212 to 249**
2.	The firm is not blacklisted by KPT or any other Government organization/Agency undertaking on Rs.100 /- stamp paper.	**Complied**	**129**
3.	Registration with Income Tax Deptt. provide photocopy of valid NTN Certificate and Active Tax Payer List (ATL)	**Complied**	**131 to 147**
4.	Registration with Sindh Sales Tax with SRB & General Sales Tax with FBR. Provide photocopy of valid SST & GST registration certificate	**Complied**	**135 to 138**
5.	Registration with Pakistan Engineering Council. Registration Certificate in Technical Category ME-05, ME-06 and Financial Category C-3. Provide attested copy of PEC Certificate	**Complied**	**140**
6.	The bidder shall submit their bid on original tender documents duly filled with each page signed and stamped against each column as token of acceptance.	**Complied**	**257 to 312**
7.	**a.** The bidder shall submit comparative of their technical specification against the KPT'S tender specification duly filled with each column of each page and duly signed, stamped along with required original / copy of technical literature of offered equipment and drawings required in technical specifications. **b.** In case any deviation against the KPT technical specification, the same may be elaborated separately by the bidder.	**Complied**	**148 to 211**
8.	Incase of Joint Venture (JV), the leading firm should be registered in Pakistan Engineering Council (PEC) relevant category and having experience in shipbuilding / repair and maintenance of floating crafts.	**N/A**	**N/A**

19/5

19/5/15

II). TECHNICAL REQUIRMENT

Minimum Qualifying Marks =**70% in each category**
The points / marks shall be given in the following manners:

Summary of marks / points

	Category	Maximum point / marks	To qualify Minimum points to be scored separately in each category
a.	Status of firm	10	7 i.e 70% of 10 marks
b.	Professional Capability	30	21 i.e 70% of 30 marks
c.	Relevant Experience	40	28 i.e 70% of 40 marks
d.	Financial	20	14 i.e 70% of 20 marks
Total		100	70 i.e 70% of 100 marks

S.No.	Description		
a.	STATUS OF FIRM : (Max. marks-10) (Min marks 07)		M/s Al Meena Marine Engineers
	i). .Private Limited / corporation	05 marks	04
	.Partnership	04 marks	
	. Proprietor	3.5 marks	
	ii) . Completion of 15 years of firm established	05 marks	
	Completion of 10 years of firm established	04 marks	05
	. Completion of 08 years of firm established	3.5 marks	
	.Below 08 years of firm established (Evidence to be provided)	00 marks	
		Total	09 Marks

19/5

19/5/25

b.	**PROFESSIONAL CAPABILITY** **(Max. marks-30) (Min marks 21)**		**M/s Al Meena Marine Engineers**
	i). **Managerial staff. (10 Marks)** • CEO / Director (15 years experience) • Director / General Manager Engineering/ Technical (10 years experience) • Director / General Manager Finance (10 years experience) ii). **Technical staff.(10 Marks)** Provide detail of technical staff involved in shipbuilding / repair & maintenance of floating Craft. • Marine / Naval Architect Engineer having 08-10 years experience in shipbuilding / repair and maintenance of floating craft. • Mechanical / Electrical /Electronic / Mechatronics Engineer having 10 years experience in ship / craft repairing. 08 – • Mechanical / Electrical /Electronic / Mechatronics Engineer having 08 years experience in ship / craft repairing 05 – iii). **OWN Work Facility (10 marks) (Firm must have their Own Workshop).** Detail to be provided, regarding miscellaneous work of floating craft, repairing workshop facility, fully equipped with machine & tools required for subject work having following accessories. ▪ Repairing facility for floating craft (workshop facility) ▪ Electrical and Mechanical facilities. ▪ 24/7 facility for diagnosing faults.	**10 marks** **8.5 marks** **07 marks** **10 marks** **8.5 marks** **07 marks** **04 marks** **03 marks** **03 marks**	**10** **10** **04** **03** **03**
	Total		**30 Marks**
c.	**EXPERIENCE OF FIRM** **(Max. Marks-40) (Min Marks 28)** Give reference to (documentary proof)		**M/s Al Meena Marine Engineers**
	EXPERIENCE OF FIRM ▪ 07 projects for ship / craft repair and maintenance contracts i.e. (TSHD, Bucket Dredger, Hopper Barge, Tugs, Floating Cranes, Ferry Boats). ▪ 05 projects for ship / craft repair and maintenance contracts i.e. (TSHD, Bucket Dredger, Hopper Barge, Tugs, Floating Cranes, Ferry Boats). ▪ 03 projects for ship / craft repair and maintenance contracts i.e. (TSHD, Bucket Dredger, Hopper Barge, Tugs, Floating Cranes, Ferry Boats.	**40 marks** **34 marks** **28 marks**	**40**
	Total		**40 Marks**

19/5

19/5/25

d.	**FINANCIAL SOUNDNESS** (Max. marks-20) (Min. marks-14)		M/s Al Meena Marine Engineers
	Turnover Rs 250 Million and above. Rs 200 Million and less than Rs 250 Million. Rs 150 Million and less than Rs 200 Million. Below Rs 150 Million.	20 marks 16 marks 14 marks 00 marks	20
	Total		20 Marks
	Grand Total (a+b+c+d)	100 Marks	99Marks
Formula For Evaluation		**M/s Al Meena Marine Engineers**	
➢ **Technical Score =** **Bidder's Technical Score** X 70 **Total Technical Score**		99 x 70 100 = 69.3 Scores	

Mech. Eng (Tugs)
(Member)

19/5/25
Asst. Manager Finance
(Member)

Dy.CME (W/S)
(Member)

Dy. CME (F/C –I & II)
(Member)

19/5
CHIEF MECH & ELECT ENGINEER –I
(Convener)