



**KARACHI PORT TRUST**

GATEWAY TO PAKISTAN



عزم عالی شان شاد رہے پاکستان

Dated: 06-03-2023

**EVALUATION REPORT**  
(As Per PPRA Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)  
**TECHNICAL & FINANCIAL EVALUATION REPORT**  
(As Per PPRA Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

01	Name of Procuring Agency	<b>Karachi Port Trust</b>
02	Method of Procuring	Notice for inviting Tenders through News Papers Published in Daily Express Tribune On 08-09-2022 & Daily Nai Baat On 09-09-2022, KPT & PPRA Websites, under PPRA Rule 36(b) from Bidders i-e Single Stage Two Envelope.
03	Title of Procurement	<b><u>RE-HABILITATION OF THE ROADS AT EAST WHARE.</u></b>
04	Tender Inquiry No	E/CS-2(868)/
05	PPRA Ref No. (TSE)	TS489511E
06	Date & Time of Bid Closing	27-09-2022 at 1030 AM
07	Date & Time of Bid Opening	27-09-2022 at 1100 AM
08	No. of Bid Received	04 (Four) Nos.
08	Criteria of Bid Evaluation	Most Advantageous Bid under Rule 36(b) PPRA
09	Detail of Bid (s) Evaluation	<u>As Per Technical Evaluation Sheet &amp; Financial Departmental Tender Committee Report (attached).</u>

S. No.	Name of Bidder	Marks		Evaluated Cost	Rule / Regulation / SBD / Policy / Basis of Rejection/Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules,2004
		Technical (If Applicable)	Financial (If Applicable)		
1.	M/s. Deen Muhammad.	76.30	29.17	Rs. 107,127,934.09	Most Advantageous Bidder
2.	M/s. Friends Construction Syndicate (PVT) Ltd.	73.50	30.00	Rs. 104,181,320.67	Most Advantageous Bidder
3	M/s. Ammar Enterprises.	67.90	26.57	Rs. 117,649,495.74	Most Advantageous Bidder

**Most Advantageous Bidder: - M/s. Deen Muhammad.**

11. Any other additional /supporting information, the procuring agency may like to share (DTC Report and Comparative Statement, Technical Evaluation Sheet).

Signature Jungas 27/03/23.

Official Stamp  
Executive Engineer (South)  
KARACHI PORT TRUST

Head Office. Eduljee Dinshaw Road I. I. Chundrigar Road, Karachi Phone # 99214530-40  
Fax # 99214329-30

S.No. 39

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE DEPARTMENTAL TENDER COMMITTEE HELD ON  
11-01-2023 IN THE COMMITTEE ROOM OF THE ENGINEERING DEPARTMENT, KPT.**

**NAME OF WORK:- RE-HABILITATION OF THE ROADS AT EAST WHARF.**

The DTM (E) has requested for repair of roads at East Wharf & accordingly the AXEN (KW), as per the Periodically round, inspected the road infrastructure situated at East Wharf, KPT and observed that, with the passage of time, existing Carpet of roads at various places have ripped off and wide ditches have developed at different places & the same are causing hindrances in smooth flow of traffic particularly heavy cargo vehicles, and may leads to any untoward incident at any time. Hence, requires re-carpeting in-order to avoid the same.

Further, the roads in front of CM&EE-II Office towards CWH at East Wharf also requires to be refurbished by using paver blocks, instead of Road Carpeting to match with surrounding area. This paved surface will be helpful in enhancing and extending the useful life span of the infrastructure as its durability has already been experienced near SOB Bridge at East Wharf.

1. Accordingly, the tenders were invited in Press on 08-09-2022 and uploaded on KPT / PPRA & MoMA Websites on 06-09-2022 in accordance to the Rule 36 (b) of PPRA and received on 27-09-2022.
2. In response, the following Four (04) Firms have submitted their sealed Technical / Financial Proposals.

S.No.	Name of Firms
1.	M/s. Deen Muhammad
2.	M/s. Friends Construction Syndicate (Pvt) Ltd.
3.	M/s. Ammar Enterprises
4.	M/s. Al-Madad Construction Co.

3. Technical Proposals for the above 04 firms were opened on same day in the presence of the Committee Members or their representative viz:

1.	Reps of General Manager (CW)	Convener
2.	Reps. of General Manager (O)	Member
3.	Reps. of General Manager (E)	Member
4.	Reps. of General Manager (A)	Member
5.	Reps. of General Manager (P&D)	Member
6.	Reps. of General Manager (F)	Member
7.	Reps. of General Manager (RED)	Member
8.	Reps. of Port Intelligence Officer	Member

4. Accordingly, as per procedure, an In-house Committee was constituted to evaluate the Technical Bids as per the Evaluation/Qualification Criteria given in the Bidding Document. The In-house Committee constitutes of following officers:

1.	Engr. Ismail Soomro	Ag. Dy. Chief Engineer-I	Convener
2.	Engr. Syed Jamil Akhter	Executive Engineer	Member
3.	Engr. Zubair Uddin	Executive Engineer	Member
4.	Engr. Dilawar Khan	Asstt. Executive Engineer	Member
4.	Mr. Haris Finance Department	Finance Officer (Rep. of Finance Manager)	Member

5. Evaluation of the Technical Bids has been carried out as per the criteria and the documents provided by the bidders. The detailed chart duly signed by the Technical Evaluation Committee as per the Technical Evaluation Report (TER) (Placed at S.No. 16 to 19), following Three Bidders stood Technically qualified:

S.No.	Name of Firms	Remarks
1.	M/s. Deen Muhammad	Qualified
2.	M/s. Friends Construction Syndicate (Pvt) Ltd.	Qualified
3.	M/s. Ammar Enterprises	Qualified

6. The Departmental Tender Committee (DTC) Members recommended the Technical Evaluation Report of the In-house Committee vide its meeting held on 18-11-2022 detail minutes placed at S.No.27.
7. After the approval from the Competent Authority on 20-12-2022 (Placed at PP-22), the Financial Bids of Technically Qualified firms were opened in the presence of members of Department Tender Committee on 26-12-2022. Attendance sheet is placed at S.No. 33.
8. Accordingly, as per procedure, an In-house Committee was constituted on the following officers to evaluate the Financial Bids as per the Criteria prescribed in the Tender Documents. (Placed at S.No. 35).

1.	Engr. Ismail Soomro	Ag. Dy. Chief Engineer-I	Convener
2.	Engr. Arif Badr Ansari	Dy. Chief Engineer-II	Member
3.	Engr. Zubairuddin	Executive Engineer	Member
4.	Engr. Dilawar Khan	Asstt. Executive Engineer	Member
4.	Mr. Haris Finance Department	Finance Officer (Rep. of Finance Manager)	Member

9. Further, the Evaluation of the Financial Bids was carried out as per the criteria as mentioned in the Documents. The Financial Evaluation is duly signed by the Financial Evaluation Committee and reference of the same is placed as under and original at S.No. 36.

FINAL EVALUATION							
S. No.	Name of Firm	Amount Quoted	Financial Score = 30 X (Amount quoted by lowest bidder/ amount quoted by bidder)	Technical Score	70% of Technical Score	Final Score = 70% of Technical Score + 30% of Financial Score	Status
1	M/s Deen Muhammad	107,127,934.09	29.17	109.00	76.30	105.47	Most advantageous bidder
2	M/s Friends Construction Syndicate	104,181,320.67	30.00	105.00	73.50	103.50	
3	M/s Ammar Enterprises	117,649,495.74	26.57	97.00	67.90	94.47	

**PARTICULARS OF BID:**


- a) Authority of Sanction. KPT Board
- b) Budget Provision figures. Rs. 350.0 (M)
- c) Estimate for the job. Rs. 94,018,284.00
- d) Debit Head The cost of work will be debited to "*Capital Expenditure*" Head of Accounts Code No.01013012-082199 (Sundry Small Building) Project No. 16002 of 2022-23 (ADP) wherein an amount of Rs. 350.0 (M) proposed under budget 2022-23.
- e) Date on which tender notice was published in Press 08-09-2022
- Date on which tender notice was published KPT, PPRA & MoMA Websites 06-09-2022
- f) Date of opening of Technical & Financial Proposal ➤ Technical 27-09-2022  
➤ Financial 26-12-2022
- g) Total No. of Bids Sold. Not Known (Uploaded on Website)
- h) Total No. of Proposal received. 04 Nos.
- i) Date when Departmental Tender Committee meeting held. Technical 18-11-2022
- j) Detail of offers received.
- | S.No. | <u>Name of Tenderers</u>                       | <u>Corrected Tendered Amount Including 5% Contingencies</u> |
|-------|------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------|
| 1.    | M/s. Deen Muhammad                             | Rs. 107,127,934.09                                          |
| 2.    | M/s. Friends Construction Syndicate (Pvt) Ltd. | Rs. 104,181,320.67                                          |
| 3.    | M/s. Ammar Enterprises                         | Rs. 117,649,495.74                                          |
- k) Position of offer recommended for acceptance as compared with other offers. Most Advantageous Evaluated Bid
- l) Validity period of the offers. Six months expiring on 26-03-2023
- m) Past performance of the tenderer recommended and how they behaved in the past. M/s. Deen Muhammad is registered with Pakistan Engineering Council in category "C-A". They have participated first time in KPT. However, they have carried many works in other Department as per profile. The firm fulfill the eligibility criteria as per Tender Documents.

**10. RECOMMENDATIONS OF IN-HOUSE COMMITTEE:**


Keeping in view the recommendation of the Technical & Financial Evaluation of the In-house Committee, it has been observed that, Bidder M/s. Deen Muhammad after all due diligence have become the most advantageous Bidder and the same can be observed from the chart as tabulated on the next page:

FINAL EVALUATION							
S. No.	Name of Firm	Amount Quoted	Financial Score = 30 X (Amount quoted by lowest bidder/ amount quoted by bidder)	Technical Score	70% of Technical Score	Final Score = 70% of Technical Score + 30% of Financial Score	Status
1	M/s Deen Muhammad	107,127,934.09	29.17	109.00	76.30	105.47	Most advantageous bidder
2	M/s Friends Construction Syndicate	104,181,320.67	30.00	105.00	73.50	103.50	
3	M/s. Ammar Enterprises	117,649,495.74	26.57	97.00	67.90	94.47	


In the light of the evaluation done as mentioned above, the In-house Committee recommends to the Departmental Tender Committee for accepting the Award of Contract to the Most Advantageous Evaluated Bid having maximum final score of 105.47. Hence, the most advantageous evaluated Bid amounting to **Rs.107,127,934.09 (Rupees: One Hundred Seven Million One Hundred Twenty Seven Thousand Nine Hundred Thirty Four & Nine Paise Only)** received from **M/s. Deen Muhammad** which is 13.94% above the corresponding estimated cost of Rs.94,018,260.00 based on KPT schedule of rates (2002) draft 2013 & current market rates is considered reasonable and recommended for the award of the contract, as the same seems viable due to the economic un-certainty and surge in inflation across all over the country.

  
**ENGR. ARIF BADR**  
 DY. CHIEF ENGINEER-II  
 (MEMBER)

  
**ENGR. DILAWAR KHAN**  
 ASSTT. EXECUTIVE ENGINEER  
 (MEMBER)

  
**ENGR. ZUBAIR UDDIN**  
 EXECUTIVE ENGINEER  
 (MEMBER)

  
**MR. HARIS USMAN**  
 ASSTT. FINANCE MANAGER  
 (MEMBER)

  
**ENGR. ISMAIL SOOMRO**  
 Ag. DY. CHIEF ENGINEER  
 (CONVENER)

**RECOMMENDATIONS:**

Accordingly a DTC meeting was called on 12-01-2023 for finalizing the recommendations of the In –House Committee and during discussion DTC Members pointed out that, there is a very cut throat competition between the most advantageous bidder and the second lowest bidder, therefore, recheck of the evaluation may be carried out by the Department and accordingly assurance was given by the Department to the DTC Committee that, from every aspect calculations have been re-checked and apparently all working seems to be in order.

Hence, in accordance to the In-house’s Committee’s recommendation Report with Tender Documents under Award of Contract and assurance the Most Advantageous Evaluated Bid is having a maximum final score of 105.47.

Therefore, the most advantageous evaluated Bid amounting to **Rs.107,127,934.09 (Rupees: One Hundred Seven Million One Hundred Twenty Seven Thousand Nine Hundred Thirty Four & Nine Paisa Only)** received from **M/s. Deen Muhammad** which is 13.94% above the corresponding estimated cost of Rs.94,018,260.00 based on KPT schedule of rate (2002) draft 2013 & current market rates is considered reasonable and recommended for the award of the contract.

GENERAL MANAGER (O)   
 (MEMBER)

GENERAL MANAGER (E)   
 (MEMBER)

16/01/23   
 GENERAL MANAGER (A)   
 (MEMBER)

13/1/23   
 GENERAL MANAGER (P&D)   
 (MEMBER)

12/1/23   
 GENERAL MANAGER (F)   
 (MEMBER)

13/1/2023   
 GENERAL MANAGER (RED)   
 (MEMBER)

12/1/23   
 PORT INTELLIGENCE OFFICER   
 (MEMBER)

12/1/2023   
 GENERAL MANAGER (CW)   
 (CONVENOR)

S.No. 37

**KARACHI PORT TRUST**  
**ENGINEERING DEPARTMENT**

**SUB: RE-HABILITATION OF THE ROADS AT EAST WHARF**  
**FINAL EVALUATION**

S. No.	Name of Firm	Amount Quoted	Financial Score = 30 X (Amount quoted by lowest bidder/ amount quoted by bidder)	Technical Score	70% of Technical Score	Final Score = 70% of Technical Score + 30% of Financial Score	Status
1	M/s Deen Muhammad	107,127,934.09	29.17	109.00	76.30	105.47	Most advantageous bidder
2	M/s Friends Construction Syndicate	104,181,320.67	30.00	105.00	73.50	103.50	
3	M/s Ammar Enterprises	117,649,495.74	26.57	97.00	67.90	94.47	

  
 ASST. EXECUTIVE ENGINEER (W)  
 (MEMBER)

  
 FINANCE OFFICER  
 (MEMBER)  
 4/11/2023

  
 DY. CHIEF ENGINEER-II  
 (MEMBER)

  
 DY. CHIEF ENGINEER-I  
 (CONVENER)

  
 EXECUTIVE ENGINEER (S)  
 (MEMBER)

SAB 27

**MINUTES OF MEETING OF DEPARTMENTAL TENDER COMMITTEE HELD**  
**ON 18-11-2022.**

**NAME OF WORK:- RE-HABILITATION OF THE ROADS AT EAST WHARF.**

**RECOMMENDATIONS OF DEPARTMENTAL TENDER COMMITTEE:**

1. The in-house Technical Evaluation Committee has carried out the Evaluation of the Bids and has recommended only three firms technically qualified out of 04 Nos. Firms.
2. Accordingly, the Technical Evaluation Report was placed before the DTC members, but at the same time PIO one of the DTC Member suggested that, prior to finalization of the Technical Evaluation Report Ground Check of the all the contesting firms is necessary and may be carried out.
3. In the light of above suggestion of PIO rest of the DTC Members agreed for the Ground Check of the firms and in this regard necessary Report from the PIO has been received by the Department on date 17-11-2022. In the report PIO has mentioned that, out of the four contesting Firms only M/s. Deen Muhammad Govt. Contractor office has not been found at the mentioned address. Considering the current scenario the status of the firms now stands as under:

S.#	NAME OF QUALIFIED FIRMS	OBTAINED MARKS	REMARKS	GROUND CHECK REPORT
1.	M/s. Deen Muhammad	<b>90.83</b>	Qualified	Firm does not exists at the given address
2.	M/s. Friends Construction Syndicate (Pvt) Ltd.	<b>87.50</b>	Qualified	Firm has an office setup at the given address and engaged in Civil Works.
3.	M/s. Ammar Enterprises	<b>80.83</b>	Qualified	The said office of the firm was found closed due to renovation / repairing. Further, firm is presently running their business from Suit No. 502, 5 <sup>th</sup> Floor, Asian pacific Trade Center, near Shell Petrol Pump, Gulshan-e-Iqbal, Main Rashid Minhas Road, Karachi and engaged in Civil Works.
4.	M/s. Al Madad Construction Co.	<b>64.17</b>	Not Qualified, due to not fulfilling the Financial aspects as laid down in Bidding Documents at PP-8	Firm has an office setup at the given address and engaged in Civil Works.



4. Keeping in view the recommendations of the Technical Evaluation Committee, DTC is of the opinion that, Office address / existence (setup) not mentioned as a mandatory condition by the Department in the advertisement for the work nor PEC has any mandatory clause regarding the Office address / Setup, therefore DTC is of the opinion that in order to promote healthy competition the Financial Bids of all the 03 Nos. Technically Qualified Firms may be opened.
5. Hence, in view of the above explanation, the DTC agrees with the recommendations of the In-house Technical Evaluation Committee and further recommends that, Financial Bids of the 03 Nos. Technically qualified firms for the work of **“RE-HABILITATION OF THE ROADS AT EAST WHARF”** may please be opened, with the approval of the Competent Authority.



GENERAL MANAGER (O)  
(MEMBER)



GENERAL MANAGER (E)  
(MEMBER)



GENERAL MANAGER (A)  
(MEMBER)



GENERAL MANAGER (P&D)  
(MEMBER)



GENERAL MANAGER (F)  
(MEMBER)



GENERAL MANAGER (RED)  
(MEMBER)



PORT INTELLIGENCE OFFICER  
(MEMBER)



GENERAL MANAGER (CW)  
(CONVENOR)