

# TECHNICAL EVALUATION REPORT

(As per Rule 35 of PP Rules 2004)

1	Name of Procuring Agency:	Karachi Port Trust
2	Method of Procurement:	Notice for tender invitation through news paper published in Daily The News, daily Dunya on 01.11.2024 and KPT & PPRA websites on 06.11.2024 under PPRA rule 36(b) i.e. single stage two envelope.
3	Title of Procurement:	Solarization of KPT sports complex: supply installation & commissioning of 60 KW on-grid solar system at KPT Sports Complex.
4	Tender Inquiry No:	E-10/2024
5	PPRA Ref. No (TSE):	TS550361E
6	Date & Time of Bid Closing:	28-11-2024 at 11:00 hrs
7	Date & Time of Bid Opening:	28-11-2024 at 11:30 hrs
8	No of Bids Received:	09 Nos
9	Criteria for Bid Evaluation:	As per TEC
10	Details of Bid(s) Evaluation:	Given Below

Name of Bidder	Technical Marks	Rule/ Regulation/SBD/policy /Basis for Rejection/ Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules,2004
M/s Ideal Power Solutions (Pvt) Ltd	100 Marks Weightage= 70 out of 70	Qualified
M/s A&A Enterprises	98.5 Marks Weightage= 68.95 out of 70	Qualified
M/s Creative Electronics (Pvt) Ltd	95 Marks Weightage= 66.5 out of 70	Qualified
M/s Direct Energy (Pvt) Ltd	94 Marks Weightage= 65.8 out of 70	Qualified
M/s Ningbo Green Light Energy (Pvt) Ltd	91 Marks Weightage= 63.7 out of 70	Qualified
M/s Cosmos Energies	83.5 Marks Weightage= 58.45 out of 70	Qualified
M/s Base Ten International (BTI)	38 Marks < Minimum qualifying marks	Disqualified
M/s City Solar (Pvt) Ltd	Not evaluated due to non compliance of mandatory conditions	Disqualified
M/s Taykal Engineering Services	Not evaluated due to non compliance of mandatory conditions	Disqualified

11. Any other additional / supporting information, the procuring agency may like to share.  
(Attached)

Signature:.....

Dy. Chief Electrical Engineer (O&M)  
TEC Convener  
Karachi Port Trust

Official Stamp:.....

KARACHI PORT TRUST  
DCEE S&C SECTION  
Berth No.10, Keamari, Karachi

IR:NO: 67

DATED: 16/1/25



No.(M)/Elect/12  
Dated 16-01-2025

Mech & Elect Engg Deptt.  
M.I. YARD , West Wharf,  
Karachi

DY.CHIEF ELECT. ENGINEER(S&C)

SUBJECT: SOLARIZATION OF KPT SPORTS COMPLEX: SUPPLY INSTALLATION  
& COMMISSIONING OF 60 KW ON-GRID SOLAR SYSTEM AT KPT SPORTS  
COMPLEX.

Reference:

DCEE (S&C) letter No. (M)/Elect/10/2024/339 dated 02-12-2024

In pursuance to the tender vide reference above, it is intimated that original file of subject case along with 09 offers submitted by participants i.e.

- i. M/s. A&A Enterprises
- ii. M/s. Creative Electronics (Pvt) Ltd
- iii. M/s. Ningbo Green Light Energy (Pvt) Ltd
- iv. M/s. Ideal Power Solutions (Pvt) Ltd
- v. M/s. City Solar (Pvt) Ltd
- vi. M/s. Taykal Engineering Services
- vii. M/s. Direct Energy (Pvt) Ltd
- viii. M/s. Cosmos Energies
- ix. M/s. Base Ten International

Technical Evaluation Committee reviewed listed firms mandatory requirements along with Performa 'A&B'. The committee determined that three firms did not meet the mandatory tender requirements and TEC. As such, they will not be further considering due to following reasons.

1. **M/s. Base Ten International** has failed to secure minimum qualifying marks (i.e. 70 Marks), mandatory required for TEC criteria.
2. **M/s. City Solar (Pvt) Ltd** Financial statements for 03 years does not meet with minimum average turnover of Rs. 15 Million, which is mandatory requirement of TEC for said tender.
3. **Taykal Eng. Services** Financial statements for 03 years does not meet with minimum average turnover of Rs. 15 Million, which is mandatory requirement of TEC for said tender.

The following six firms meet mandatory TEC requirements and declared technically qualified, their financial bid may be opened.

1. **M/s. A&A Enterprises**
2. **M/s. Creative Electronics (Pvt) Ltd**
3. **M/s. Ningbo Green Light Energy (Pvt) Ltd**
4. **M/s. Ideal Power Solutions (Pvt) Ltd**
5. **M/s. Direct Energy (Pvt) Ltd**
6. **M/s. Cosmos Energies**

**Enclosed:**

Subject Tender file (Original)

TEC report

Performa 'A&B' for bidders Comparisons

BOQ Comparisons

 15/1/25

**DY. CHIEF ELECTRICAL ENGINEER (O&M)**

**Convener**

**Copy To:**

**CMEE-II**

**GM (E)**

**KARACHI PORT TRUST**  
**MECH & ELECT ENGG DEPTT**

**SOLARIZATION OF KPT SPORTS COMPLEX: SUPPLY INSTALLATION & COMMISSIONING OF 60 KW ON-GRID SOLAR SYSTEM AT KPT SPORTS COMPLEX.**

**TECHNICAL EVALUATION REPORT**

1. It is submitted that with the approval of Competent Authority the subject tenders were invited through press advertisement under PPRA rule 36(b) (i.e. single stage two envelope procedure) and the same were published in the newspapers on 01-11-2024 and accordingly uploaded on KPT and PPRA websites. The last date of issue of tender was fixed on 27-11-2024.. Tender Bid opened on 28-11-2024.
2. In response following nine bidders participated and submitted Technical offers.
  - i. M/s. A&A Enterprises
  - ii. M/s. Creative Electronics (Pvt) Ltd
  - iii. M/s. Ningbo Green Light Energy (Pvt) Ltd
  - iv. M/s. Ideal Power Solutions (Pvt) Ltd
  - v. M/s. City Solar (Pvt) Ltd
  - vi. M/s. Taykal Engineering Services
  - vii. M/s. Direct Energy (Pvt) Ltd
  - viii. M/s. Cosmos Energies
  - ix. M/s. Base Ten International
3. In this regards, first meeting of technical evaluation committee was held on 04-12-2024 at 10:00 hrs in the office of DYCEE(O&M). The meeting was chaired by DYCEE(O&M) and following members attended the meeting.
  - a) Dy.CEE(O&M)
  - b) EE(West)
  - c) Asst. Manager Finance



4. During the meeting the technical proposal reviewed by above technical committee and discusses the technical proposal.
5. The second meeting of the committee was held on 10:00hrs dated 09-12-2024 and all the committee members attended the meeting. During the meeting the technical proposal was reviewed by above technical committee and after detailed deliberations some discrepancies were observed regarding mandatory requirement of evaluation criteria and other terms & conditions and the same were forwarded to Dy.CEE(S&C) vide Dy.CEE(O&M) letter No.(M)/Elect/O&M/Solar/2024/196 dated: 13-12-2024 for following shortcoming clarification was asked from bidders to furnish.

**CLARIFICATIONS:**

**M/s. A&A Enterprises**

1.	Does not specify make of items / materials i.e. Panels, Inverters, Lighting arrestors, AC & DC breakers and cables in their BOQ as per KPT Scope of Work for said tender.
----	---

**M/s. Creative Electronics (Pvt) Ltd**

1.	In case of companies and firms, last 03 years financial statements are to be provided showing minimum average turnover of Rs 15 million. (Financial statement for year 2024 Not provided)
2.	Does not provide technical staff(Engineers) list along with detailed CV / Resume.

**M/s. Ningbo Green Light Energy (Pvt) Ltd JV with Telecom Foundation (Pvt) Ltd**

1.	Elaborate / Define responsibilities related to technical & financial of each firm agreed in your JV agreement.
2.	Does not provide Sales Tax Certificate of Ningbo Green Light Energy.
3.	Does not provide contracts for relevant solar work of 60KW or above. Provide documentary proof with support of client's work order towards experience of solar work of 60KW or above.
4.	Does not provide List of work facility equipments required in TEC.
5.	Does not specify make of items / materials i.e. Panels, Inverters, Lighting arrestors, AC & DC breakers and cables in their BOQ as per KPT Scope of Work for said tender.

**M/s. Ideal Power Solutions (Pvt) Ltd**

1.	In case of companies and firms, last 03 years financial statements are to be provided showing minimum average turnover of Rs 15 million. (Financial statement for year 2024 Not provided)
----	---

**M/s. City Solar (Pvt) Ltd**

1.	Does not meet with minimum average turnover of Rs. 15 million in provided financial statements which is mandatory requirement of TEC for said tender.
2.	Does not provide contracts for relevant solar work of 60KW or above. Provide documentary proof with support of client's work order towards experience of solar work of 60KW or above.
3.	Does not specify make of items / materials i.e. Panels, Inverters, Lighting arrestors, AC & DC breakers and cables in their BOQ as per KPT Scope of Work for said tender.

**M/s. Taykal Engineering Services JV with Solway (Pvt) Ltd**

1.	Does not provide Joint Venture agreement affidavit.
2.	Does not provide FBR tax return of individuals of 2022 & 2023
3.	PEC of Solway (Pvt) Ltd is expired.
4.	Does not provide PPIB certificate of Taykal Engineering Services
5.	Does not provide NTN certificate of Solway (Pvt) Ltd
6.	Does not provide contracts for relevant solar work of 60KW or above. Provide documentary proof with support of client's work order towards experience of solar work of 60KW or above.
7.	Does not specify make of items / materials i.e. Panels, Inverters, Lighting arrestors, AC & DC breakers and cables in their BOQ as per KPT Scope of Work for said tender.

*ms*

**M/s. Direct Energy (Pvt) Ltd**

1.	Does not provide Director/Controller experience with detailed CV / Resume.
2.	Does not provide technical staff experience with detailed CV / Resume.
3.	Does not provide contracts for relevant solar work of 60KW or above. Provide documentary proof with support of client's work order towards experience of solar work of 60KW or above.
4.	Does not specify make of items / materials i.e. Panels, Inverters, Lighting arrestors, AC & DC breakers and cables in their BOQ as per KPT Scope of Work for said tender.

**M/s. Cosmos Energies**

1.	Does not provide FBR tax returns of individuals for year 2024.
2.	Does not provide sales tax certificates i.e. GST / SRB certificates.
3.	Does not provide signed Affidavit of Non-Blacklisting of firm.
4	Does not provide List of work facility equipments required in TEC.
5.	Does not provide contracts for relevant solar work of 60KW or above. Provide documentary proof with support of client's work order towards experience of solar work of 60KW or above.
6.	Does not specify make of items / materials i.e. Panels, Inverters, Lighting arrestors, AC & DC breakers and cables in their BOQ as per KPT Scope of Work for said tender.



**M/s. Base Ten International**

1.	Does not provide FBR tax returns of individuals for last 3 years.
2.	Does not provide copy of tax certificates i.e. GST/SSST,NTN, ATL certificates.
3.	Does not provide Director / Controller experience with detailed CV / Resume.
4.	Does not provide technical staff experience with detailed CV / Resume.
5.	Does not provide List of work facility equipments required in TEC.
6.	Does not provide contracts for relevant solar work of 60KW or above. Provide documentary proof with support of client's work order towards experience of solar work of 60KW or above.
7.	Does not specify make of items / materials i.e. Panels, Inverters, Lighting arrestors, AC & DC breakers and cables in their BOQ as per KPT Scope of Work for said tender.

6. In response above mentioned bidders submitted their clarifications for above shortcomings.
7. The third meeting of the committee was held on 30-12-2024 at 10:00hrs in the office of DYCEE(O&M) and all committee members attended the meeting. The committee again discuss the response received from bidders and reviewed the mandatory conditions of evaluation criteria. The committee after detail deliberations and discussions produces following observations:

**OBSERVATIONS:**

- **M/s. City Solar (Pvt) Ltd**  
Financial statements for 03 years of above mentioned bidder does not meet with minimum average turnover of Rs. 15 Million as per mandatory requirement of TEC for said tender. Hence does not evaluate further.
- **M/s. Taykal Engineering Services**  
Financial statements for 03 years of above mentioned bidder does not meet with minimum average turnover of Rs. 15 Million as per mandatory requirement of TEC for said tender. Hence does not evaluate further.
- **M/s. Base Ten International (BTI)**  
Above mentioned bidder has provided only 1 contract of relevant work experience as of subject tender while TEC minimum requirements for relevant work experience are 2 contracts.





9. The detailed evaluation of technical bid of 09 Nos. bidders as per evaluation criteria is given as under:

**MANDATORY REQUIREMENT:**

The firms should fulfill for the following mandatory requirement / condition and supporting documents should be submitted accordingly:  
**CAUTION:** Non compliance of any Mandatory Conditions will leads rejection of bid and no further evaluation:-

S.No	Description	A&A Enterprises	Creative Electronic (PVT) LTD	Ningbo Green Light Energy (PVT) LTD	Ideal Power Solution (PVT) LTD	Direct Energy (PVT) LTD	Cosmos Energies	Base Ten International
1.	In case of companies and firms, last 03 years financial statements are to be provided showing minimum average turnover of Rs 15 million. OR In case of individuals / Sole proprietors, last 03 years tax returns filed with FBR are to be provided showing minimum turnover of Rs 15 million minimum on average.	COMPLY S. No. 1	COMPLY S. No. 11 & Flag "B"	COMPLY Flag "V"	COMPLY S. No. 32 & Flag "F"	COMPLY S. No. 60	COMPLY S. No.70 & Flag "X"	COMPLY Flag "N"
2.	Pakistan Engineering Council registration certificate for financial limit in Category C-6 technical categories EE-04,EE-11.	COMPLY S. No. 2	COMPLY S. No. 12	COMPLY S. No. 21	COMPLY S. No. 30	COMPLY S. No. 61	COMPLY S. No. 71	COMPLY S. No. 81
3.	Affidavit is to be submitted on Rs 100/- stamp paper mentioning therein that the firm has not been black listed by any Government / Semi Government / Autonomous / Semi Autonomous body.	COMPLY S. No. 3	COMPLY S. No. 13	COMPLY S. No. 22	COMPLY S. No. 31	COMPLY S. No. 62	Before Flag "Y"	COMPLY S. No. 82
4	Copy of certificate of NTN, GST, SRB & fresh copy of Active tax payer list (ATL).	COMPLY S. No. 4	COMPLY S. No. 14	COMPLY S. No. 23	COMPLY S. No. 34	COMPLY S. No. 63	COMPLY S. No. 72	COMPLY Flag "O" & S. No. 83
5.	The bidder shall submit their bid on original tender documents duly filled with each page signed and stamped against each column as token of acceptance.	COMPLY	COMPLY	COMPLY	COMPLY	COMPLY	COMPLY	COMPLY
6.	Copy of registration Certificate from private power & infrastructure board (PPIB) in C3 category.	COMPLY Before S. No. 2	COMPLY S. No. 15	COMPLY S. No. 24	COMPLY S. No. 33	COMPLY S. No. 61	COMPLY After S. No. 71	COMPLY After S. No. 81

**TECHNICAL REQUIREMENT**

Minimum Qualifying Marks =70% in each category  
The points / marks shall be given in the following manners:

**Summary of marks / points**

Category	Maximum point / marks	To qualify Minimum points to be scored separately in each category
A. Status of firm	10	7 i.e 70% of 10 marks
B. Professional Capability	30	21 i.e 70% of 30 marks
C. Relevant Experience	40	28 i.e 70% of 40 marks
D. Financial	20	14 i.e 70% of 20 marks
<b>Total</b>	100	<b>70 i.e 70% of 100 marks</b>

S.No	Description	Max / Min Marks	A & A Enterprise	Creative Electronics (PVT) LTD	Ningbo Green Light Energy (PVT) LTD	Ideal Power Solution (PVT) LTD	Direct Energy (PVT) LTD	Cosmos Energies	Base Ten International
A.	<b>STATUS OF FIRM : (Max. marks-10) (Min marks 07)</b>								
i).	Private Limited / corporation Partnership Proprietor	05 marks 04 marks 3.5 marks	3.5 marks S.No.3 & 4	05 marks S. No. 14	05 marks S. No. 23	05 marks S. No. 34	05 marks S. No. 63	3.5 marks S. No. 72	3.5 marks S. No. 83
ii).	Completion of 04 years of firm established Completion of 03 years of firm established Completion of 02 years of firm established Below 02 years of firm established (Evidence to be provided)	05 marks 04 marks 3.5 marks 00 marks	05 marks S. No. 04	05 marks S. No. 14	05 marks S. No. 23	05 marks S.No. 34	04 marks S. No.63	05 marks S. No. 72	05 marks S. No. 83
<b>Total</b>			<b>8.5 Marks</b>	<b>10 Marks</b>	<b>10 Marks</b>	<b>10 Marks</b>	<b>09 Marks</b>	<b>8.5 Marks</b>	<b>8.5 Marks</b>



C.	<p><b>RELEVANT EXPERIENCE OF SOLARIZATION WORK.</b> Max. marks -40 (Min marks 28) Give reference to (documentary proof) in.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 05 contracts for Solar Installation work 60KW or above.</li> <li>▪ 03 contracts for Solar Installation work 60KW or above.</li> <li>▪ 02 contracts for Solar Installation work 60KW or above.</li> </ul>	<p>Max / Min Marks</p> <p>40 marks</p> <p>34 marks</p> <p>28 marks</p>	A & A Enterprises	Creative Electronics (PVT) LTD	Ningo Green Light Energy (PVT) LTD	Ideal Power Solution	Direct Energy (PVT) LTD	Cosmos Energies	Base Ten International
D.	<p><b>FINANCIAL SOUNDNESS</b> (Max. marks-20) (Min marks 14)</p> <p><b>Turnover.</b> 25 Million and above. 20 Million and less than 25 Million. 15 Million and less than 20 Million. Below 15 Million.</p>	<p>20 Marks</p> <p>S.NO.01 &amp; S.NO.07</p> <p>20 Marks</p> <p>S.No.11 &amp; Flag "B"</p> <p>20 Marks</p> <p>Flag "V"</p> <p>20 Marks</p> <p>S.NO.32 &amp; Flag "F"</p> <p>20 Marks</p> <p>S.NO.60</p> <p>20 Marks</p> <p>S.NO.70 &amp; Flag "X"</p> <p>20 Marks</p> <p>S.NO.85 &amp; Flag "N"</p>	<p>40 Marks</p> <p>S.NO.06</p> <p>40 Marks</p> <p>S.NO.18</p> <p>40 Marks</p> <p>Flag "E"</p> <p>40 Marks</p> <p>S.NO.38</p> <p>34 Marks</p> <p>S.NO.75</p> <p>00 Marks</p> <p>Only 1 contract Before Flag "R"</p>	<p>98.5 Mark</p> <p>95 Mark</p> <p>91 Mark</p> <p>100 Mark</p> <p>94 Mark</p> <p>83.5 Mark</p> <p>38 Mark</p> <p>38 Mark &lt; 70 Marks i.e. Minimum qualifying marks</p>	<p>Grand Total (A+B+C+D)</p>	<p>98.5 x 70 / 100 = 68.95 Score</p> <p>95 x 70 / 100 = 66.5 Score</p> <p>91 x 70 / 100 = 63.7 Score</p> <p>100 x 70 / 100 = 70 Score</p> <p>94 x 70 / 100 = 65.8 Score</p> <p>83.5 x 70 / 100 = 58.45 Score</p> <p>Failed</p>	<p>Technical Score = Bidder's Technical Score x 70 / Total Technical Score</p>		

**RECOMMENDATIONS:**

The technical evaluation committee reviewed the technical proposal and after detailed deliberation and discussion unanimously recommended that:

03 Nos. firms i.e.:

1. **M/s. Base Ten International** has failed to secure minimum qualifying marks (i.e. 70 Marks), mandatory required for TEC criteria.
2. **M/s. City Solar (Pvt) Ltd** Financial statements for 03 years does not meet with minimum average turnover of Rs. 15 Million, which is mandatory requirement of TEC for said tender.
3. **Taykal Eng. Services** Financial statements for 03 years does not meet with minimum average turnover of Rs. 15 Million, which is mandatory requirement of TEC for said tender.

Hence above three firms does not meet mandatory TEC & tender requirements therefore does not evaluated further.


06 Nos. firms i.e.:

1. **M/s. A&A Enterprises**
2. **M/s. Creative Electronics (Pvt) Ltd**
3. **M/s. Ningbo Green Light Energy (Pvt) Ltd**
4. **M/s. Ideal Power Solutions (Pvt) Ltd**
5. **M/s. Direct Energy (Pvt) Ltd**
6. **M/s. Cosmos Energies**

Above six firms meet mandatory TEC requirements and declared technically qualified, their financial bid may be opened.

  
ASSTT MANAGER FINANCE  
Member

  
ELECTRICAL ENGINEER (WEST)  
Member

  
DY. CHIEF ELECTRICAL ENGINEER (O&M)  
Convener